

Online Appendix B. Tables 4-6 in LaLonde (1986)

The following tables are adapted from Tables 4, 5, and 6 in LaLonde (1986). We thank Robert LaLonde's estate for allowing us to include these tables in the Appendix.

TABLE 4—EARNINGS COMPARISONS AND ESTIMATED TRAINING EFFECTS FOR THE NSW AFDC PARTICIPANTS USING COMPARISON GROUPS FROM THE *PSID* AND THE *CPS-SSA*^{a,b}

Name of Comparison Group ^d	Comparison Group Earnings Growth 1975–79 (1)	NSW Treatment Earnings Less Comparison Group Earnings				Difference in Differences: Difference in Earnings Growth 1975–79 Treatments Less Comparisons		Unrestricted Difference in Differences: Quasi Difference in Earnings Growth 1975–79		Controlling for All Observed Variables and Pre-Training Earnings	
		Pre-Training Year, 1975		Post-Training Year, 1979		Without Age		Unad-justed		Without AFDC	
		Unad-justed (2)	Ad-justed ^c (3)	Unad-justed (4)	Ad-justed ^c (5)	Age (6)	Age (7)	justed (8)	justed ^c (9)	AFDC (10)	With AFDC (11)
Controls	2,942	– 17	– 22	851	861	833	883	843	864	854	–
<i>PSID</i> -1	(220) 713	(122) – 6,443	(122) – 4,882	(307) – 3,357	(306) – 2,143	(323) 3,097	(323) 2,657	(308) 1746	(306) 1,354	(312) 1664	(652) 2,097
<i>PSID</i> -2	(210) 1,242	(326) – 1,467	(336) – 1,515	(403) 1,090	(425) 870	(317) 2,568	(333) 2,392	(357) 1,764	(380) 1,535	(409) 1,826	(491) –
<i>PSID</i> -3	(314) 665	(216) – 77	(224) – 100	(468) 3,057	(484) 2,915	(473) 3,145	(481) 3,020	(472) 3,070	(487) 2,930	(537) 2,919	(577) –
<i>PSID</i> -4	(351) 928	(202) – 5,694	(208) – 4,976	(532) – 2,822	(543) – 2,268	(557) 2,883	(563) 2,655	(531) 1,184	(543) 950	(592) 1,406	(642) 2,146
<i>CPS-SSA</i> -1	(311) 233	(306) – 6,928	(323) – 5,813	(460) – 3,363	(491) – 2,650	(417) 3,578	(434) 3,501	(483) 1,214	(503) 1,127	(542) 536	(652) 1,041
<i>CPS-SSA</i> -2	(64) 1,595	(272) – 2,888	(309) – 2,332	(320) – 683	(365) – 240	(280) 2,215	(282) 2,068	(272) 447	(309) 620	(349) 665	(503) –
<i>CPS-SSA</i> -3	(360) 1,207	(204) – 3,715	(256) – 3,150	(428) – 1,122	(536) – 812	(438) 2,603	(446) 2,615	(468) 814	(554) 784	(651) – 99	(720) 1,246
<i>CPS-SSA</i> -4	(166) 1,684	(226) – 1,189	(325) – 780	(311) 926	(452) 756	(307) 2,126	(328) 1,833	(305) 1,222	(429) 952	(481) 827	(720) –
	(524)	(249)	(283)	(630)	(716)	(654)	(663)	(637)	(717)	(814)	

^aThe columns above present the estimated training effect for each econometric model and comparison group. The dependent variable is earnings in 1979. Based on the experimental data, an unbiased estimate of the impact of training presented in col. 4 is \$851. The first three columns present the difference between each comparison group's 1975 and 1979 earnings and the difference between the pre-training earnings of each comparison group and the NSW treatments.

^bEstimates are in 1982 dollars. The numbers in parentheses are the standard errors.

^cThe exogenous variables used in the regression adjusted equations are age, age squared, years of schooling, high school dropout status, and race.

^dSee Table 2 for definitions of the comparison groups.

TABLE 5—EARNINGS COMPARISONS AND ESTIMATED TRAINING EFFECTS FOR THE NSW MALE PARTICIPANTS USING COMPARISON GROUPS FROM THE *PSID* AND THE *CPS-SSA*^{a, b}

Name of Comparison Group ^d	Comparison Group Earnings Growth 1975–78 (1)	NSW Treatment Earnings Less Comparison Group Earnings				Difference in Differences: Difference in Earnings Growth 1975–78 Treatments Less Comparisons		Unrestricted Difference in Differences: Quasi Difference in Earnings Growth 1975–78		Controlling for All Observed Variables and Pre-Training Earnings (10)
		Pre-Training Year, 1975		Post-Training Year, 1978		Without Age (6)	With Age (7)	Unad-justed (8)	Ad-justed ^c (9)	
		Unad-justed (2)	Ad-justed ^c (3)	Unad-justed (4)	Ad-justed ^c (5)					
Controls	\$2,063 (325)	\$39 (383)	\$ – 21 (378)	\$886 (476)	\$798 (472)	\$847 (560)	\$856 (558)	\$897 (467)	\$802 (467)	\$662 (506)
<i>PSID</i> -1	\$2,043 (237)	– \$15,997 (795)	– \$7,624 (851)	– \$15,578 (913)	– \$8,067 (990)	\$425 (650)	– \$749 (692)	– \$2,380 (680)	– \$2,119 (746)	– \$1,228 (896)
<i>PSID</i> -2	\$6,071 (637)	– \$4,503 (608)	– \$3,669 (757)	– \$4,020 (781)	– \$3,482 (935)	\$484 (738)	– \$650 (850)	– \$1,364 (729)	– \$1,694 (878)	– \$792 (1024)
<i>PSID</i> -3	(\$3,322) (780)	(\$455) (539)	\$455 (704)	\$697 (760)	– \$509 (967)	\$242 (884)	– \$1,325 (1078)	\$629 (757)	– \$552 (967)	\$397 (1103)
<i>CPS-SSA</i> -1	\$1,196 (61)	– \$10,585 (539)	– \$4,654 (509)	– \$8,870 (562)	– \$4,416 (557)	\$1,714 (452)	\$195 (441)	– \$1,543 (426)	– \$1,102 (450)	– \$805 (484)
<i>CPS-SSA</i> -2	\$2,684 (229)	– \$4,321 (450)	– \$1,824 (535)	– \$4,095 (537)	– \$1,675 (672)	\$226 (539)	– \$488 (530)	– \$1,850 (497)	– \$782 (621)	– \$319 (761)
<i>CPS-SSA</i> -3	\$4,548 (409)	\$337 (343)	\$878 (447)	– \$1,300 (590)	\$224 (766)	– \$1,637 (631)	– \$1,388 (655)	– \$1,396 (582)	\$17 (761)	\$1,466 (984)

^aThe columns above present the estimated training effect for each econometric model and comparison group. The dependent variable is earnings in 1978. Based on the experimental data an unbiased estimate of the impact of training presented in col. 4 is \$886. The first three columns present the difference between each comparison group's 1975 and 1978 earnings and the difference between the pre-training earnings of each comparison group and the NSW treatments.

^bEstimates are in 1982 dollars. The numbers in parentheses are the standard errors.

^cThe exogenous variables used in the regression adjusted equations are age, age squared, years of schooling, high school dropout status, and race.

^dSee Table 3 for definitions of the comparison groups.

TABLE 6—ESTIMATED TRAINING EFFECTS USING TWO-STAGE ESTIMATOR

		NSW AFDC Females		NSW Males	
		Heckman Correction for Program Participation Bias, Using Estimate of Conditional Expectation of Earnings Error as Regressor in Earnings Equation			
Variables Excluded from the Earnings Equation, but Included in the Participation Equation	Comparison Group	Estimate of Coefficient for			
		Training Dummy	Estimate of Expectation	Training Dummy	Estimate of Expectation
Marital Status, Residency in an SMSA, Employment Status in 1976, AFDC Status in 1975, Number of Children	PSID-1	1,129 (385)	− 894 (396)	− 1,333 (820)	− 2,357 (781)
	CPS-SSA-1	1,102 (323)	− 606 (480)	− 22 (584)	− 1,437 (449)
	NSW Controls	837 (317)	− 18 (2376)	899 (840)	− 835 (2601)
Employment Status in 1976, AFDC Status in 1975, Number of Children	PSID-1	1,256 (405)	− 823 (410)	−	−
	CPS-SSA-1	439 (333)	− 979 (481)	−	−
	NSW Controls	−	−	−	−
Employment Status in 1976, Number of Children	PSID-1	1,564 (604)	− 552 (569)	− 1,161 (864)	− 2,655 (799)
	CPS-SSA-1	552 (514)	− 902 (551)	13 (584)	− 1,484 (450)
	NSW Controls	851 (318)	147 (2385)	889 (841)	− 808 (2603)
No Exclusion Restrictions	PSID-1	1,747 (620)	− 526 (568)	− 667 (905)	− 2,446 (806)
	CPS-SSA-1	805 (523)	− 908 (548)	213 (588)	− 1,364 (452)
	NSW Controls	861 (318)	284 (2385)	889 (840)	− 876 (2601)

Notes: The estimated training effects are in 1982 dollars. For the females, the experimental estimate of impact of the supported work program was \$851 with a standard error of \$317. The one-step estimates from col. 11 of Table 4 were \$2,097 with a standard error of \$491 using the *PSID-1* as a comparison group, \$1,041 with a standard error of \$503 using the *CPS-SSA-1* as a comparison group, and \$854 with a standard error of \$312 using the NSW controls as a comparison group. Estimates are missing for the case of three exclusions using the NSW controls since AFDC status in 1975 cannot be used as an instrument for the NSW females. For the males, the experimental estimate of impact of the supported work program was \$886 with a standard error of \$476. The one-step estimates from col. 10 of Table 5 were \$– 1,228 with a standard error of \$896 using the *PSID-1* as a comparison group, \$– 805 with a standard error of \$484 using the *CPS-SSA-1* as a comparison group, and \$662 with a standard error of \$506 using the NSW controls as a comparison group. Estimates are missing for the case of three exclusions for the NSW males as AFDC status is not used as an instrument in the analysis of the male trainees.